

Table 1 Studies included and the baseline characteristics of patients

First author (year)	study design	sample size	Age (years)	Male (%)	AF ablation history	PAF (%)	LVEF (%)	CHA ₂ DS ₂ -VASc score	HAS-BLED score	Follow-up time (months)
Fassini (2019)	single-center observation study	49	69.0±8.0	67.3	No	51.0	54.0±5.0	2.8±1.2	3.0±1.0	42.0 (25.0-58.0)
Wintgens (2018)	prospective non-randomized multi-center study	349	63.1±8.2	57.9	Yes	56.4	60.3±8.2	3.0 (2.0-4.0)	3.0 (2.0-3.0)	34.5 (24.0-44.0)
Phillips (2020)	prospective international multi-center study	142	64.2±7.2	54.2	No	69.0	NA	3.4±1.4	1.5±0.9	24.0
Du (2019)	multi-center experience	122	66.4±8.8	59.8	No	50.0	62.0±7.1	4.3±1.4	3.3±1.0	11.5±6.8
Liu (2019)	prospective multi-center study	50	64.9±7.7	66.0	No	54.0	63.9±9.0	3.7±1.4	2.5±0.9	20.2±11.5
Alipour (2015)	nonrandomized prospective study	62	64.0±8.0	64.5	No	62.9	NA	3.0 (2.8-4.0)	2.0 (2.0-3.0)	38.0 (25.0-45.0)
Liu (2020)	a cohort study	27	64.7±6.3	74.1	No	63.0	61.2±3.9	4.8±1.4	3.6±1.3	18.0 (9.0-23.0)
Calvo (2015)	a cohort study	35	70.0±7.0	71.4	No	28.6	NA	3.1±1.1	3.1±1.0	13.0 (3.0-75.0)
Du (2018)★	single-center retrospective study	52	66.1±7.8	51.9	No	44.2	61.2±6.4	4.2±1.3	3.5±1.1	11.2±7.3
Du (2018)▲	single-center retrospective study	30	66.3±9.5	70.0	No	56.7	62.2±8.7	4.7±1.4	3.4±0.9	11.2±7.3
Mo (2020)	single-center	76	69.9±7.9	51.3	No	48.7	63.9±6.3	3.6±1.3	3.3±1.1	24.0±5.2

	retrospective study									
Ren (2020)	single-center retrospective study	42	70.0±7.6	61.9	No	100.0	60.9±4.2	3.8±2.1	3.7±1.2	20.0±9.0
Chen (2020)	single-center observation study	178	68.9±8.1	52.8	Yes	49.4	64.0±5.9	3.3±1.5	1.6±1.0	12.0
Li (2020)	single-center observation study	61	66.7±9.2	41.0	No	6.6	NA	4.2±1.1	3.4±1.1	12.0
Swaans (2012)	non-randomized prospective study	30	62.8±8.5	70.0	No	43.3	NA	3.0 (3.0–5.0)	2.0 (1.0–3.0)	12.0
Li (2018)	single-center observation study	25	64.2±3.5	60.0	No	12.0	NA	4.5 (2.0-6.0)	3.2 (1.0-7.0)	12.0
Phillips (2016)	single-center retrospective study	98	65.0±7.0	68.4	Yes	57.1	61.0±8.0	2.6±1.0	1.6±0.8	>12.0

AF: atrial fibrillation; PAF: paroxysmal atrial fibrillation; LVEF: left ventricular ejection fraction; NA: not available.